

DOES WOMEN'S EMPOWERMENT HAVE ECONOMIC BENEFITS?

MERYL J WILLIAMS @ IIFET 2014, BRISBANE, AUSTRALIA



DOES WOMEN'S EMPOWERMENT HAVE ECONOMIC BENEFITS?

- 1. WORK IN FISH VALUE CHAINS IS STRONGLY GENDERED**
- 2. FISHERIES AND OTHER STUDIES SHOW THAT NARROW ECONOMIC EFFORTS TO "EMPOWER WOMEN" OFTEN FAIL**
- 3. GENDER IN FISH VALUE CHAINS HAS RARELY BEEN SUBJECT TO ECONOMIC ANALYSIS**
 - WOULD ECONOMIC ANALYSES IMPROVE THE UNDERSTANDING OF GENDER INEQUALITY IN FISH VALUE CHAINS?**



1. FISH VALUE CHAIN WORK IS GENDERED

- **IN FISHERIES VALUE CHAINS, WOMEN ARE:**
 - **47% OF WORKFORCE BUT CONCENTRATED IN POST HARVEST JOBS - *HIDDEN HARVEST*, WORLD BANK 2012**
 - **FISHERIES LAW AND POLICY FOCUSES ON PRODUCTION ISSUES; GENDER BLIND BUT NOT GENDER NEUTRAL**
- **IN AQUACULTURE AND FISHERIES PRODUCTION:**
 - **WOMEN'S PRODUCTION IS OFTEN UNCOUNTED, E.G., INVERTEBRATE COLLECTING (DANIKA KLEIBER ET AL 2014)**
 - **LARGER SCALE, MECHANISED ENTERPRISES INVOLVE FEWER WOMEN THAN SMALL SCALE, E.G., SHRIMP, SALMON FARMS**
- **SOCIAL ASPECTS OF VALUE CHAINS OVERLOOKED IN FAVOUR OF ECONOMIC, ENVIRONMENTAL, E.G., TRADE, SUSTAINABILITY**



Gender inequality is endemic in fish value chains

2. FISHERIES AND OTHER STUDIES SHOW THAT NARROW ECONOMIC EFFORTS TO “EMPOWER WOMEN” OFTEN FAIL

- **LOOKING FROM THE WOMEN’S PERSPECTIVES: A REVIEW OF EVIDENCE IN ASIAN FISHERIES SOCIETY PAPERS ON WOMEN’S EMPOWERMENT (CHOO POH SZE & MERYL WILLIAMS, IN PRESS)**
- **LOOKING MORE BROADLY: CONCLUSIONS FROM BROADER ECONOMIC STUDIES**



Choo and Williams (In Press) applied Longwe (2002) Levels Of Empowerment Framework to 20 papers addressing women's empowerment from 5 AFS Symposia – based on concepts of power

LONGWE'S LEVELS OF EMPOWERMENT

1. Welfare	zero level of empowerment; women as passive recipients, given benefits to improve their socio-economic status rather than producing such benefits for themselves
2. Access	first level of empowerment; women improve their own status from increased access to resources.
3. Conscientisation	realisation that women's relative lack of access to resources actually arises from discriminatory practices and rules; a collective move to remove the discriminatory practices; dissatisfaction with the established patriarchal order.
4. Mobilisation	complements conscientisation; women come together for the analysis of problems, identification of strategies to overcome discriminatory practices, and collective action to remove these practices.
5. Control	This level is reached when women have taken action so that there is gender equality.

EXAMPLES

1. Welfare level

- Donor projects in Vietnam (1) and Bangladesh (2) added to women's work loads but did not increase their decision-making power in the households.
- These were based on assumptions that work for income would empower the women.

2. Welfare to access (and back)

- NGO experiences showed that long learning periods (decades) and accompanying organisational development is needed, e.g., CARE-Bangladesh, Caritas.
- Fragile access arrangements threaten women's gains, e.g., for Kerala mussel farm sites, Bangladesh water bodies, and fail to provide social power, e.g., women divers for high value shellfish in Japan and Korea.
- Culture inhibits women from taking up rights, opportunities, e.g., Thailand, France.
- Degradation of natural resources reduced women's traditional access, e.g., Btsisi Malaysia, Tanzania.
- In fish trading, women's soft power can help them, e.g., former cross-border trade from Cambodia to Thailand, or reduce their roles as chains develop, e.g., Mali

EXAMPLES

3. From access to conscientisation and some control

- **In Taiwan, women entrepreneurs can have control; women academics have access but not conscientisation**

- **No examples of conscientisation and mobilisation and only individual cases of control**
- **In the specific cases, women experienced inequality and low levels of empowerment; their economic contributions were mainly small**

WHAT OTHER GENDER ECONOMIC STUDIES SHOW

- **GENDER EQUALITY CONTRIBUTES TO ECONOMIC GROWTH BUT THAT ECONOMIC GROWTH DID NOT NECESSARILY LEAD TO GREATER EQUALITY (REVIEW BY KABEER AND NATALI, 2013)**
- **ASSOC. OF WOMEN IN DEVELOPMENT, AYAKO IBA (BLOGS BASED ON FEMINIST ECONOMICS RESEARCH):**
 - **GENDER WAGE GAP IS OFTEN FUELLED BY JOB SEGREGATION**
 - **GENDER WAGE DISCRIMINATION CAN STIMULATE ECONOMIC GROWTH. E.G., BY EXPORTS**
 - **MACRO-ECONOMIC POLICIES CAN STIMULATE GENDER INEQUALITY**
 - **MORE FOCUS IS NEEDED ON THE IMPORTANCE OF HOUSEHOLD RELATIONS**

These results are relevant to gender in fish value chains

3. COULD ECONOMIC ANALYSES IMPROVE THE UNDERSTANDING OF GENDER INEQUALITY IN FISH VALUE CHAINS?

- **NONE OF THE AFS STUDIES REVIEWED WAS AN ECONOMIC ANALYSIS**
- **VERY FEW ECONOMIC PAPERS ARE PRESENTED IN THE *AFS* GENDER/WOMEN SYMPOSIA**
- **VERY FEW GENDER/WOMEN PAPERS ARE PRESENTED IN *IFET* CONFERENCES AND THE ECONOMICS LITERATURE**

WHAT COULD ECONOMICS CONTRIBUTE?

- **IDEAS FROM THE DEVELOPMENT OF FEMINIST ECONOMICS**
- **SUGGESTIONS FROM SOME FISHERIES ECONOMISTS**
 - **PROF. ANDY THORPE (U. PORTSMOUTH) – PROFESSOR OF DEVELOPMENT ECONOMICS, LEAD AUTHOR: “FISHING NA EVERYBODY BUSINESS”: WOMEN’S WORK AND GENDER RELATIONS IN SIERRA LEONE’S FISHERIES” FEMINIST ECONOMICS (2014)**
 - **PROF. DALE SQUIRES (NOAA, UCSD) – FISHERIES ECONOMIST, PROF. NATURAL RESOURCE ECONOMICS, EXPERT IN THE ECONOMICS OF TECHNOLOGICAL CHANGE, EXTERNALITIES**

FEMINIST ECONOMICS

- **THE JOURNAL *FEMINIST ECONOMICS*:**
 - **“THE GOAL OF *FEMINIST ECONOMICS* IS NOT JUST TO DEVELOP MORE ILLUMINATING THEORIES, BUT TO IMPROVE THE CONDITIONS OF LIVING FOR ALL CHILDREN, WOMEN, AND MEN”**
- **HIGH ACADEMIC REPUTATION, RIGOROUS JOURNAL STANDARDS**
 - **BUT OFTEN NOT CITED BY THE MAINSTREAM, E.G., 2013 IMF WORKNOTE “*WOMEN, WORK, AND THE ECONOMY: MACRO-ECONOMIC GAINS FROM GENDER EQUITY*” IGNORED (AWID AND AYAKO IBA BLOGS)**



ZERO DRAFT IDEAS FOR GENDER AND FISH VALUE CHAIN ECONOMICS

1. IMPACTS OF MACRO-ECONOMIC POLICIES ON GENDER INEQUALITY

- **ACCESS TO AND OWNERSHIP OF RESOURCES, ASSETS**
- **GENDERED IMPACTS OF CHANGE: (1) STATE OF NATURAL RESOURCE AND THEIR MANAGEMENT, (2) TECHNOLOGICAL CHANGE**
- **POLICIES AND PROGRAMS THAT SUPPORT CERTAIN DEVELOPMENT PATHS, E.G., INTERNATIONAL TRADE, LARGE SCALE OPERATIONS**

2. ECONOMIC ANALYSES OF WORK IN FISH VALUE CHAINS – GENDER AND OTHER FACTORS

- **WORK SEGREGATION, GENDER AND OTHER WAGE GAPS**
- **RELATIONS BETWEEN SECTORAL GROWTH AND GENDER (AND OTHER) WAGE DISCRIMINATIONS, E.G., OF MIGRANT WORKERS**

3. HOUSEHOLD ECONOMICS

- **IN FISHING, FARMING, POST-HARVEST PROCESSING AND MARKETING HOUSEHOLDS – ADAPT METHODS FROM AGRICULTURE**
- **MORE FOCUS NEEDED ON IMPORTANCE OF HOUSEHOLD RELATIONS**

“

WHAT SHOULD IIFET BE DOING TO HELP STIMULATE ECONOMIC AND TRADE STUDIES ON GENDER IN FISH VALUE CHAINS?

”

GENDER SESSIONS LINKED TO KEY SECTORAL ISSUES **TOP ECONOMISTS AS MENTORS AND LEADERS FOR GENDER THEMES**

ATTENTION TO THE GENDER OF KEYNOTE SPEAKERS **THEMES FOR KEYNOTE ADDRESSES**

AWARDEES AND RECOGNITION **GENDER OF OFFICE HOLDERS**

REFERENCES

- ASSOCIATION FOR WOMEN IN DEVELOPMENT (AWID) 2014. FEMINIST ECONOMISTS RESPOND TO THE RECENT IMF DISCUSSION NOTE WOMEN, WORK, AND THE ECONOMY: MACROECONOMIC GAINS FROM GENDER EQUITY 2 (PARTS). WWW.AWID.ORG
- CHOO, POH SZE. AND MERYL J. WILLIAMS. IN PRESS. AVOIDING PITFALLS IN DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS THAT ASPIRE TO EMPOWER WOMEN: A REVIEW OF THE ASIAN FISHERIES SOCIETY GENDER AND FISHERIES SYMPOSIUM PAPERS. ASIAN FISHERIES SCIENCE, (FORTHCOMING)
- INTERNATIONAL MONETARY FUND. 2013. WOMEN, WORK, AND THE ECONOMY: MACRO-ECONOMIC GAINS FROM GENDER EQUITY. IMF WORKNOTE
- IBA, AYAKO. 2013. BOOK LAUNCH OF NEW FRONTIERS IN FEMINIST POLITICAL ECONOMY. AYAKO IBA BLOG, 20 NOVEMBER, 2013.
- KABEER, N. AND L. NATALI. 2013. GENDER EQUALITY AND ECONOMIC GROWTH: IS THERE A WIN-WIN? INSTITUTE OF DEVELOPMENT STUDIES, WORKING PAPER 417. 58 PP.
- KLEIBER, DANIKA, LEILA M HARRIS & AMANDA C J VINCENT. 2014. GENDER AND SMALL-SCALE FISHERIES: A CASE FOR COUNTING WOMEN AND BEYOND. FISH AND FISHERIES DOI: 10.1111/FAF.12075
- LONGWE, S.H. 2002. SPECTACLES FOR SEEING GENDER IN PROJECT EVALUATION. PAPER PRESENTED IN UNDERSTANDING GENDER EVALUATION METHODOLOGY, AFRICA WORKSHOP, 16 NOVEMBER 2002. [HTTP://WWW.APCWOMEN.ORG/GEMKIT/EN/UNDERSTANDING_GEM/LONGWE.HTM](http://www.apcwomen.org/gemkit/en/understanding_gem/longwe.htm)
- PORTER, MARILYN. IN PRESS. WHAT DOES FEMINIST METHODOLOGY CONTRIBUTE TO GENDER AND FISHERIES SCIENCE? ASIAN FISHERIES SCIENCE [FORTHCOMING]
- THORPE, ANDY, NICKY POWW, ANDREW BAIO, RANITA SANDI, ERNEST TOM NDOMAHINA & THOMAS LEBBIE (2014): "FISHING NA EVERYBODY BUSINESS": WOMEN'S WORK AND GENDER RELATIONS IN SIERRA LEONE'S FISHERIES, FEMINIST ECONOMICS, DOI: 10.1080/13545701.2014.895403
- WORLD BANK. 2012. HIDDEN HARVEST: THE GLOBAL CONTRIBUTION OF CAPTURE FISHERIES. WORLD BANK, WASHINGTON, DC. REPORT NUMBER 66469-GLB.