Let's Teach 4-H Club Members How to Make Decisions Through JUDGING

Oregon 4-H Leaders' Guide Club Series A-62 May 1960

Cooperative Extension Service Oregon State College, Corvallis
Let's Teach 4-H Club Members
How to Make Decisions Through Judging

LOIS REDMAN
State Agent, 4-H Club Work
Oregon State College

Susie and Tommy wait anxiously at the close of the 4-H meeting for their cookies to finish baking. When they take them from the oven, they give you, their leader, the first cookies and ask, “Is it good?” Or, you stop by a member’s home to see a newly purchased dairy calf and Joe asks, “How does he look?” Should you, as a leader, give them the answers or will you help them make this decision for themselves?

All of us make decisions every day. As we push ourselves away from the dinner table, we usually say to ourselves or others, “That was a good meal.” Or, maybe we say, “That meat wasn’t very tender.” Club members have to make decisions every day. Tommy has to decide which shirt to wear to school. Susie has to decide which dress she will wear. Decisions and more decisions!

Club members want to learn to evaluate their project work. They want to learn to recognize good products; to know what are good standards. This takes lots of practice and along with this comes practice in how to make decisions. This should be an important part of many of your club meetings.

Teach Good Standards

In the past it was thought by some that standards could only be taught by setting up a class of four products and having members place them first, second, third, and fourth. Many times club members are asked to bring products, such as cookies, to club meetings. Then Susie’s, Mary’s, Fern’s, and Carol’s cookies are compared with each other. For younger members especially is this practice good? Put yourself in Susie’s place. If you were 10 years old and just learning to make cookies, how would you feel when your cookies placed last?

Today we recognize that placing a class of four products of different quality is the last step in teaching good standards. There are important steps that go before this.

We must first learn the characteristics of the product we are judging. Let’s take muffins for example. Before deciding whether muffin A is better than muffin B, we need to know what a good muffin is. This we learn by studying just one good muffin. Take a look at this good muffin and consider these things: A—general appearance; about 2 inches across and not less than 1 ½ inches high and evenly browned. B—shape; uniform, rounded top, not peaked. C—crust; crisp, tender, breaks easily without crumbling, slightly rough. D—texture; light in weight, springs back when pressed with finger, no tunnels. E—grain; even and moderately fine. F—good in flavor.

Now all of us won’t agree exactly on just what a good muffin looks and tastes like. Some like dark brown ones, maybe you like them light brown. Some like them king size, others like them very small. But we can agree on general characteristics.

Many score cards like the one above for muffins are included in the 4-H project books so members can learn these characteristics.

Members should keep studying just one product, whether it be a dress, muffin, cow, or pig, until familiar with the characteristics and terms that describe it. When members know these and have some idea of what a good product really is, they are ready to compare one against the other. Start by having them compare just two products of different quality, then compare three, and finally a class of four products.
Judging Card

A sample of a judging card available for use in club, county, and state judging events is shown below. Card is 4 x 6 inches in size.

Club members would keep this card until they have finished judging all classes. Then it would be turned in to the judge or person in charge of the event. Members should be told that they are expected to do their own work and their placings should not be discussed with other members while changing classes. “We’ll use the honor system.” At a contest, members should be given two cards so they can keep one.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OREGON 4-H JUDGING CARD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food Preparation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name or Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Numbers here correspond to the numbers on sample judging card.)

1. Write the project division being judged here. Example: food preparation, clothing, dairy, or vegetables.

2. Identification of the participant. Could be name or number and either club or county if this information was desired.

3. Name of the classes being judged. Example: If food preparation this could be biscuits, muffins, equipment, and summer breakfast menu; or in vegetables it could be sweet potatoes, onions, green beans, and carrots.

4. Members placing. Example used on card. Members decided in class of summer breakfast that C was best, B second, A third, and D was fourth. This is listed under “My Placing.”

5. Official placing. After judging event is finished and scores are recorded, members should return to discuss the classes with the judge. At this time, members could write in the official placings on the card they kept.

6. Placing score. This would be filled out by the person in charge of the contest. At a practice session, members could fill in their own scores.

7. Reason score. This could be from oral or written reasons. Judge or person in charge of contest would fill in score.
A Standard Class

A standard class includes four things of different quality (but remember two or three will do for practice sessions). Either numbers or letters can be used to identify the products in a class. Use either 1-2-3-4 or A-B-C-D.

Animals are numbered from left to right when standing behind them. Pigs can be numbered with chalk or with numbers on small pieces of cardboard fastened to a snapper clothes pin—this is clipped to the hair on the back of the pig. This could be used on other animals too. Numbers or letters written on cards can be used for foods, clothing, crops, etc.

When preparing a class, each product must be of different quality. It is good to have a fairly obvious top or bottom or a fairly wide division between the top and the two bottom items in the class.

Members are usually given 5 to 10 minutes for judging a class and 2 minutes for giving oral reasons. When written reasons are required, members will need more time for judging these classes.

We’re Ready to Judge a Class

Members should have a system for judging. The keen judge is always orderly, never haphazard. Take a good look at the class from a distance—don’t hurry right in and start feeling or tasting. Get in mind a clear picture of the whole class first, then examine them closer, feel or taste if this is permitted.

We judge with all our senses. When judging livestock, we look and feel. When judging foods, we need to taste and smell as well as look. We like to feel texture of fabrics as well as look when judging clothing.

After looking, feeling and/or tasting, decide which product in the class measures highest to the good standards members have learned. Then place the others in the order in which they measure up to this top one.

When judging livestock at fairs, members could sit on bleachers. Cattle should be led in a circle so members get a good side, front, and rear view. Then let members move up closer and if permitted feel the animal. At the end, have members step back and get another look from a distance. If judging horses, they should not be led in a circle, but in a straight line, away from and then toward the members so they can get a good view of the horses’ action at a walk and trot.

Giving Reasons

Giving reasons why you placed a class a certain way is probably more important than the actual placing. Giving reasons separates the lucky guessers from the good judges. Giving reasons helps members to organize their thinking and teaches them to express themselves in a logical, convincing manner.

Reasons can be given orally, written or both. Members probably learn more by giving them orally, but if time or other factors limit this, written reasons should be given.

We’ve said before, judging is comparing. When giving reasons, divide the class into three sets of pairs for comparison. Example:

If the placing for a certain class is DBCA, the pairing would look like this—

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top Pair</th>
<th>Middle Pair</th>
<th>Bottom Pair</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When giving oral reasons, the members could start by saying, “I placed this class of (name class judged) DBCA.” Then tell why D was placed first and compare it against B. Then tell why B was placed above C; then why C was placed above A. A good way to summarize when finished giving reasons is by saying, “For these reasons, I placed this class of (name class judged) DBCA.”
Sample Class and Reasons

Let’s think about reasons on a class of summer breakfast menus for 4-H club members. This will help you see how reasons can be given—both oral and written. We will not attempt to list everything. To do a complete job, we would also need to know what was being planned for lunch and dinner.

(A) Cooked Prunes
   Bacon—Fried Eggs
   Toast
   Cocoa

(B) One half Grapefruit
   Soft Cooked Egg on Toast
   Wheat Cereal with Milk
   Tomato Juice

(C) Orange Juice
   Scrambled Eggs
   Toast—Butter
   Milk

(D) Apple Juice
   Pancake—Syrup
   Sweet Roll
   Water

Oral Reasons

(Beginning) I placed this class of summer breakfast menus for 4-H club members CBAD.

(First pair—C above B) I placed C first and above B because it most nearly fulfills the requirements for an adequate breakfast. It has the three important breakfast foods needed, a Vitamin C fruit, protein, and milk. It is attractive, tasty, and easily prepared. It is low in cost. B has many of these qualities too, but B does not have enough milk. There should be at least one glass of milk included, and this amount would not be used on the cereal. B also included two Vitamin C foods, and this is not necessary.

(Second Pair—B above A) I placed B above A because the soft cooked egg in B would be preferred to the two fried foods in A. A does not include a Vitamin C food. Prunes are good but a fruit rich in Vitamin C would be preferred. A does not include butter for the toast. A does have more milk than B, but cold milk would be preferred to cocoa for a summer breakfast.

(Third Pair—A above D) I placed A above D because in A eggs and milk are included. D has too many sweets.

(Bottom) D is easily the bottom because it is least attractive, lacks nutritive value, has too many sweets, and lacks three important breakfast foods, milk, protein, and Vitamin C fruit.

(Summary) For these reasons, I placed this class of summer breakfast menus for 4-H club members CBAD.

Written Reasons

Written reasons can be in sentence form or outlined as illustrated below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top Pair C above B</th>
<th>Middle Pair B above A</th>
<th>Bottom Pair A above D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attractive, tasty, easily prepared, low in cost, rich in Vitamin C, protein and milk</td>
<td>Many of same qualities, not enough milk, has two Vitamin C foods</td>
<td>Soft cooked egg preferred to fried food, has Vitamin C fruit and rich in protein</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bacon is mostly fat, no Vitamin C fruit, no butter for toast, milk preferred to cocoa for summer breakfast</td>
<td>Does include egg and milk</td>
<td>Too many sweets, not attractive, lacks nutritive value, no milk, no protein, apple juice has almost no Vitamin C</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6
Scoring Placings

Below is a chart for use in figuring scores for members' placing. If member places them as the official placing, he receives 100 points. For each placing that is wrong 15 points are deducted. Additional copies of this score chart are available at your County Extension Office.

### Score Chart for Judging-Contest Placings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Place</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1234</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1243</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2134</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1324</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Find the correct (official) placing for the class in the left hand column. Read across to the 100 score for that placing. The vertical column in which the 100 score occurs is the one used for the class. Example: if the official placing for a class was C,B,A,D or if you prefer to use numbers—3,2,1,4, this means that column 15 would be used to score this class. If a member placed them C,B,D,A, or 3,2,4,1, follow this line across to column 15. His score would be 85. If a member placed them D,B,C,A, or 4,2,3,1, his score would be 40, etc.

### Scoring Reasons

At the right is a guide to scoring reasons. How a member placed the class is scored in another way. Here we attempt to score the members on the reasons they gave for their placing.

If a member gives a good set of reasons but has the classes out of order, this should not be of great concern. If a member gives skimpy reasons, even though they placed the class right, a low reason score is justified. Namely, what they saw in the class and the way they present them to the judge is the important thing.

Section B of score guide can be used to score written reasons.

A. Organization and presentation—50 points.
   Included introduction, body, and conclusion.
   Presentation—speaking, posture, poise, English.
   Brief and to the point.

B. Knew characteristics of good product—50 points.
   Considered major points—knew what to look for, saw important differences.
   Used appropriate terminology—proper naming of parts, used descriptive adjectives (deeper body, light crust, etc.), showed variety in use of terms.

Total—100 points.
Organizing a 4-H Judging Event---
A Guide for Leaders and Agents

1. Set up classes. It may be a class of 2-3- or 4 items. For beginners make differences fairly obvious. It is best not to take things from members' exhibits to use in judging contests.

2. Mark items in the class by either letter or number. Use either 1234's or ABCD's. These should be fastened to each item securely.

3. Have supplies on hand; judging cards, additional cards or paper if reasons are written, and placing score chart. At contests a tabulation sheet may be needed.

4. Plan how to divide members into groups. Organize a rotation system for members to follow. Be sure groups are small enough so everyone can get around and see the classes.

5. Give members judging cards. If members are to turn in a card, give them two so they can keep one. Beginners may need instructions on how to fill them out. Divide members into groups.

6. Give members instructions. Tell what classes will be judged, classes to give reasons on, time allowed for classes, and if members can handle or taste items. Everyone does his own judging—no talking!

7. Members judge. Between 5 and 10 minutes is usually enough time to allow for each class. Classes where reasons will be given will need more time. If group is small, members need not be on time schedule. When finished with one class, a member could move to another. At a large event, members should be given some time at the end to finish writing their reasons.

The last three steps may not be in order, due to many different county situations. The important thing is not the order but that all three of these steps are included.

8. Scoring reasons. If oral reasons are given, judge should listen to individual members away from group. Listen—don't interrupt. When member finishes, judge may ask member questions. A score card for judging reasons is included on page 7.

9. Score placings. The placing score chart on page 7 can be used for scoring. This chart deducts 15 points for each incorrect placing. Other systems, such as the Illinois system, can be used if preferred. This system deducts more points for obvious differences than for close pairs.

10. IMPORTANT. Official placing. After judging is completed the judge should discuss classes with the members. The judge should not reveal his official placing until he has discussed the class, or he might lose the attention of his group. The judge may help the members arrive at a correct group placing by asking questions and pointing out the good and bad characteristics of each item. Members who had given a good set of reasons could give these to the whole group. This discussion should be done in front of the items judged. Members can fill in official placing on the card they kept.